

Appendix 1

Additional Reports on Apartheid

The following are additional significant reports.

Amb Palestina al Cor's, ["Apartheid Against the Palestinian People"](#)

In 2007, thirty Catalan organizations committed to peacebuilding in the Middle East began a solidarity campaign with the Palestinian people. The group issued an 80-page report in 2009, pointing to the "negation and non-respect of [the Palestinians'] dignity as human beings, which itself has a specific legal denomination: crime of apartheid." The report further stated, "It is clear that the discrimination to which the Palestinian population is subjected by Israel constitutes a crime of apartheid." Currently, the campaign receives the support of more than 60 organizations including NGO federations, unions and political parties.

[Russell Tribunal on Palestine](#)

The Russell Tribunal on Palestine, supported by the Bertrand Russell Peace Foundation, was "an international citizen-based Tribunal of conscience created in response to the demands of civil society (NGOs, charities, unions, faith-based organisations) to inform and mobilise public opinion and relevant institutions and decision-makers in light of continuing failures to uphold international law in the context of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict." In its 9-page 2012 report, the Tribunal found "multiple grounds to refute [Israel's] claim that no apartheid or segregation practices exist under Israeli jurisdiction."

UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD)'s ["Israel"](#)

In its 2012 9-page report, CERD expressed its concern about "the consequences of [Israel's] policies and practices which amount to *de facto* segregation, such as the implementation by [Israel] in the Occupied Palestinian Territory of two entirely separate legal systems and sets of institutions for Jewish communities grouped in illegal settlements on the one hand and Palestinian populations living in Palestinian towns and villages on the other hand. The Committee is particularly appalled at the hermetic character of the separation of two groups, who live on the same territory but do not enjoy either equal use of roads and infrastructure or equal access to basic services and water resources. Such

separation is concretized by the implementation of a complex combination of movement restrictions consisting of the Wall, roadblocks, the obligation to use separate roads and a permit regime that only impacts the Palestinian population.”

Birzeit University Institute of Law’s [“Advocating for Palestinian Rights in Conformity with International Law: guidelines”](#)

This guide “is an outcome of the conference ‘Options and Strategies of International Law for the Palestinian People’ held at the Birzeit University Institute of Law in May 2013. It aims to help nonlawyers understand and apply international law to Israel’s oppressive regime over the entire Palestinian people: those in the Occupied Palestinian Territory since 1967 (OPT), Palestinian citizens of Israel and the refugees since 1948. It explains briefly: 1) Why speaking only about ‘occupation’ is not enough; 2) Why we should rather speak about (settler) colonialism, population transfer (ethnic cleansing) and apartheid, in addition to occupation; 3) How we can do so in accordance with international law; and, 4) Why colonialism, population transfer and apartheid, as legal frameworks, are helpful for building pressure on third parties to take action against Israel’s oppressive regime.

UN Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (ESCWA)’s [“Israeli Practices towards the Palestinian People and the Question of Apartheid”](#)

In a 64-page report commissioned in 2017 by the UN’s ESCWA, its authors established “on the basis of scholarly inquiry and overwhelming evidence, that Israel is guilty of the crime of apartheid.” The report “accordingly recommends that the international community act immediately, without waiting for a more formal pronouncement regarding the culpability of the State of Israel, its government and its officials for the commission of the crime of apartheid.”

Statements & Resolutions

Following are statements and resolutions made by UN, church, Palestinian Christian, and Jewish groups, as well as other internationals including prominent Jewish leaders. Archbishop **Desmond Tutu** and President **Jimmy Carter** are the two most recognized world leaders to use the word *apartheid* before the rest of the world was ready to use the label. A 2014 article in Haaretz, an Israeli newspaper, [reported](#) on a visit by Tutu to Palestine and Israel. Tutu was quoted as saying, “Israel’s treatment of Palestinians reminds him of South

African apartheid... I have witnessed the systemic humiliation of Palestinian men, women and children by members of the Israeli security forces. Their humiliation is familiar to all black South Africans who were corralled and harassed and insulted and assaulted by the security forces of the apartheid government." The title to President Carter's 2007 book, widely demonized at the time, spoke—and speaks still—for itself: [Palestine: Peace Not Apartheid](#).

In a speech in Bethlehem in May 2022, South African pastor and theologian **Frank Chikane**, who for many years suffered from and fought against apartheid in South Africa, said the following:

“South Africans don't need any one to define apartheid for them. If it is apartheid, they can see it or recognise it! ... Having crisscrossed Israel and Palestine and read literature about the occupation (about 55 years), and discriminatory laws, including inhuman laws that fall under the definition of a crime against humanity one does not have a choice but to declare Israel an Apartheid State.”

World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, Durban, South Africa, [“Declaration”](#)

In 2001, the General Assembly of the United Nations hosted a global gathering to address racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance. Included in the Declaration was a strong rejection of “any doctrine of racial superiority...” Participants wrote, “We recognize that apartheid and genocide in terms of international law constitute crimes against humanity and are major sources and manifestations of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, and acknowledge the untold evil and suffering caused by these acts and affirm that wherever and whenever they occurred, they must be condemned, and their recurrence prevented.”

NGO Forum of the World Conference Against Racism (WCAR), Durban, South Africa, [“WCAR NGO Forum Declaration”](#)

Concurrent with the 2001 UN General Assembly's Conference (above), representatives of local, national and international non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other civil society groups from around the world gathered in their own forum. *The forum's Declaration is the first time that a wide gathering of civil society accused Israel of practicing apartheid against Palestinians.* In addition to affirming the right of Palestinians to self-

determination, statehood, independence and freedom, along with the right of return as stipulated in UN Resolution 194, the document recognized that the Palestinian people are “currently enduring a colonialist, discriminatory military occupation that violates their fundamental human right of self-determination including the illegal transfer of Israeli citizens into the occupied territories and establishment of a permanent illegal Israeli infrastructure; and other racist methods amounting to Israel's brand of apartheid and other racist crimes against humanity.”

The document further recognized that “the Palestinian people have the clear right under international law to resist such occupation by any means provided under international law until they achieve their fundamental human right to self-determination and end the Israeli racist system including its own brand of apartheid.”

American Friends Service Committee, [“Why AFSC uses the term “Israeli apartheid”](#)”

“As early as 2003, Palestinian human rights organization (with support from South African anti-apartheid activists) began to describe the situation in Israel and Palestine as a situation of apartheid. Over the next two decades a variety of international and Israeli leaders including former President Jimmy Carter, Israeli Prime Ministers Ehud Olmert and Ehud Barak, and former U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry all warned that without change Israel would become an apartheid state.

“We use the term to accurately describe the realities of inequality and discrimination that exist on both sides of the green line in Israel and Palestine. We use it to make clear our commitment to the realization of not just the end of Israel’s occupation, but justice and equality for all people in Israel and Palestine regardless of their location.”

Dr. Jerry Pillay, [“Apartheid in the Holy Land: Theological Reflections on the Israel and/or Palestine situation from a South African perspective”](#)”

In 2016, the [HTS Theologiese Studies/Theological Studies](#), an Open Access resource, published an article by Dr. Jerry Pillay, a faculty member in the Department of Church History and Church Polity at the University of Pretoria, South Africa. According to Dr. Pillay, “The central thesis of this [9-page] article is that the Israel-Palestine situation shows great resemblances to the experience of apartheid in South Africa which can be seen in the colonisation, the war and the forced displacement of people in Palestine. This article attempts, firstly, to

show this apartheid comparison and then proceeds to discuss the theological implications of the issues of justice and reconciliation in Israel-Palestine by referring to the same in the South African context. Drawing from the South African experience, the article also offers some reflection on the role of the Church in the Israel-Palestine context.”

National Coalition of Christian Organizations in Palestine (NCCOP), [“Open letter to the World Council of Churches and the ecumenical movement”](#)

In 2017, thirty-three Christian organizations—members of NCCOP—gathered in Bethlehem and wrote an open letter to the World Council of Churches (WCC) and the global ecumenical community. Among other requests, they called on the WCC to “recognize Israel as an apartheid state.” They pled, “We need your costly solidarity. We need brave women and men who are willing to stand in the forefront. This is no time for shallow diplomacy Christians.” They wrote, “Things are beyond urgent. We are on the verge of a catastrophic collapse. The current status-quo is unsustainable....”

UN Independent Human Rights Experts, [“21st century apartheid”](#)

In June 2020, forty-seven independent human rights experts called for the international community to oppose Israel’s announced plan to annex significant parts of the occupied Palestinian West Bank beginning in mid-2020. They wrote, “Israel has recently promised that it will maintain permanent security control between the Mediterranean and the Jordan River. Thus, the morning after annexation would be the crystallisation of an already unjust reality: two peoples living in the same space, ruled by the same state, but with profoundly unequal rights. This is a vision of a 21st century apartheid.”

Global Kairos for Justice, [“Cry for Hope: A Call to Decisive Action”](#)

In July 2020, Global Kairos for Justice (GKJ)—a worldwide coalition born in response to the Kairos Palestine document, “A Moment of Truth”—released an urgent call to Christians, churches and ecumenical institutions to embark on seven concrete actions to recognize and end Israel’s apartheid. Citing a list of actions by the U.S. administration that blindly supported Israel, the document said, “In light of these events, it is time for the international community to recognize Israel as an apartheid state.”

International Criminal Court, [“Statement of ICC Prosecutor, Fatou Bensouda, respecting an investigation of the Situation in Palestine”](#)

In 2021, the International Criminal Court printed a statement by ICC Prosecutor Fatou Bensouda in a news release announcing the opening of the court’s investigation into allegations of violations of human rights and international law. Bensouda said, “The decision to open an investigation followed a painstaking preliminary examination undertaken by my Office that lasted close to five years. During that period, and in accordance with our normal practice, the Office engaged with a wide array of stakeholders, including in regular and productive meetings with representatives of the Governments of Palestine and Israel, respectively.” In her statement, the prosecutor cautioned, “Investigations take time and they must be grounded objectively in facts and law.”

United Church of Christ General Synod, [“Declaration for a Just Peace Between Palestine and Israel”](#)

At its 2021 church-wide Synod, the United Church of Christ passed a resolution that described Israel’s oppression of Palestinians as “a matter of theological urgency [representing] a sin in violation of the message of the biblical prophets and the Gospels.” The resolution cited “Israel’s apartheid system of laws and legal procedures.”

Former Israeli ambassadors, [“It’s apartheid...”](#)

In 2021 on the South African website [Ground Up](#), two former Israeli ambassadors to South Africa penned an OpEd, declaring, “It is clearer than ever that the occupation is not temporary, and there is not the political will in the Israeli government to bring about its end.” Ilan Baruch served as Israeli Ambassador to South Africa, Namibia, Botswana, and Zimbabwe; Dr. Alon Liel served as Israeli Ambassador to South Africa and as Director General of the Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs. They wrote,

Israel is the sole sovereign power that operates in this land, and it systematically discriminates on the basis of nationality and ethnicity. Such a reality is, as we saw ourselves, apartheid. It is time for the world to recognize that what we saw in South Africa decades ago is happening in the occupied Palestinian territories too. And just as the world joined the struggle against apartheid in South Africa, it is time for the world to take decisive diplomatic action in our case as well and work towards building a future of equality, dignity, and security for Palestinians and Israelis alike.

Christian Church (Disciples of Christ) in the U.S. & Canada, [“Compelled to Witness”](#)

In February 2022, leaders of the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ) issued *Compelled to Witness*, a Pastoral Letter endorsed by the church’s Division of Overseas Ministries board that speaks both *to* the Disciples denomination and *for* the denomination to the world. It reads, in part, “Israeli policies and practices that discriminate against Palestinians—Christians and Muslims alike—are consistent with the international legal definition of the crime of apartheid.”

Jewish Voice for Peace, [“Israeli Apartheid and the Path to Teshuvah”](#)

A February 2022 Open Letter to the Jewish Community from the Rabbinic Council of [Jewish Voice for Peace](#) states,

As Jews of conscience, Israel’s system of apartheid has created a moral emergency for us. We cannot turn away. Instead, we long for the kinds of conversation which accurately reflect the reality on the ground, a reality that B’Tselem calls Jewish Supremacy....”

Michael Benyair, former Attorney General of Israel, [“With great sadness I conclude that my country is now an apartheid regime”](#)

In February 2022, in an OpEd for *The Journal*, former Attorney General of Israel Michael Benyair wrote, “It is with great sadness that I must also conclude that my country has sunk to such political and moral depths that it is now an apartheid regime. It is time for the international community to recognise this reality as well.” A former acting judge in the Israeli Supreme Court, Benyair went on to write, “The status quo on the ground is a moral abomination. The delay by the international community in taking meaningful steps to hold Israel accountable for the apartheid regime it is perpetuating is unacceptable.”

Jewish Electorate Institute, [“July 2021 National Survey of Jewish Voters”](#)

A July 2021 survey commissioned by the Jewish Electorate Institute found that 34% of American Jews agreed “Israel’s treatment of Palestinians is similar to racism in the United States.” Some 25% agreed “Israel is an apartheid state” and 22% agreed “Israel is committing genocide against the Palestinians.” 58%, said

it would be appropriate to restrict aid to Israel so it could not spend US money on settlements. The numbers climbed among younger Jews; more than a third of those under 40 gave Israel the “apartheid state” label.

Independent Jewish Voices (IJV), [Together Against Apartheid](#)

In March 2022, Independent Jewish Voices Canada, launched a campaign called [Together Against Apartheid](#). According to the [press release](#), the campaign is aimed at educating and empowering people across the country to end Israel’s oppression against Palestinians.

Selected Books and papers:

Brian Brown, *Apartheid South Africa! Apartheid Israel!: Ticking the Boxes of Occupation and Dispossession* (2022)

Ben White, *Israeli Apartheid: A Beginner’s Guide* (2009) and *Cracks in the Wall: Beyond Apartheid in Palestine/Israel* (2018)

Uri Davis, *Israel, an Apartheid State* (1987) and *Apartheid Israel: Possibilities for the Struggle Within* (2003)

Ilan Pappé (ed.), *Israel and South Africa: The Many Faces of Apartheid* (2015)

Ghada Ageel (ed.), *Apartheid in Palestine: Hard Laws and Harder Experiences* (2016)

Sizer, Stephen. *A Biblical Response to Israeli Apartheid*. [Online source](#)

Cornerstone, Issue 48, Spring 2022. A Publication by Sabeel Ecumenical Liberation Theology Center. [Online source](#).

Appendix 2

Cry for Hope

CRY FOR HOPE: A CALL TO DECISIVE ACTION

WE CANNOT SERVE GOD AND THE OPPRESSION OF THE PALESTINIANS

Public launch: 1st July 2020

Kairos Palestine and Global Kairos for Justice

We, Kairos Palestine and Global Kairos for Justice, a worldwide coalition born in response to the Kairos Palestine “Moment of Truth: a word of faith, hope, and love from the heart of Palestinian suffering,” issue this urgent call to Christians, churches and ecumenical institutions. We do this together with committed Christians in Palestine and around the world. **This is a call for decisive action** on a matter that we believe relates to the integrity of our Christian faith.

We have arrived at a critical point in the struggle to end the oppression of the Palestinian people. The State of Israel’s adoption of the Nation State Law in 2018 legalized institutional discrimination in Israel and the Palestinian territories, officially depriving Palestinians of their rights to life, livelihood, and a future in their homeland. Recent acts of the U.S. administration have supported Israel’s ongoing project of land taking and attaining control over the entire territory of Palestine. These include the 2018 move of its embassy to Jerusalem, its announcement in 2019 that the U.S. government no longer deems West Bank settlements to be “inconsistent with international law,” and the 2020 “Peace to Prosperity” plan. Fueled by U.S. support and emboldened by the ineffectual response of the international community, Israel’s newly-formed coalition government has cleared the way for outright annexation of around one third of the occupied West Bank, including the Jordan Valley. These developments make it all the clearer that we have come to the end of the illusion that Israel and the world powers intend to honor and defend the rights of the Palestinian people to dignity, self-determination, and the fundamental human rights guaranteed under international law, including the right of return for Palestinian refugees. It is time for the international community, in light of these events, to recognize Israel as an apartheid state in terms of international law.

In affirming this reality, we realize that it is incumbent upon us as followers of Jesus to take decisive action. The very being of the church, the integrity of the Christian faith, and the credibility of the Gospel is at stake. We declare that support for the oppression of the Palestinian people, whether passive or active,

through silence, word or deed, is a sin. We assert that Christian support for Zionism as a theology and an ideology that legitimize the right of one people to deny the human rights of another is incompatible with the Christian faith and a grave misuse of the Bible.

We call upon all Christians and on churches at congregational, denominational, national, and global ecumenical levels to engage in a process of study, reflection and confession concerning the historic and systemic deprivation of the rights of the Palestinian people, and the use of the Bible by many to justify and support this oppression. We call on churches to reflect on how their own traditions can express the sacred duty to uphold the integrity of the church and the Christian faith concerning this issue. We cannot serve God while remaining silent about the oppression of the Palestinians.

As we face this *kairos*, we are mindful of the legacy of faith and action of those who have come before us and have faced circumstances of urgency and crisis. In 1933 German pastor and theologian Dietrich Bonhoeffer declared that the Nazi regime's denial of the rights of Jews and the interference of the state into matters of religion placed the church in *status confessionis*. The Barmen Declaration of 1934 reinforced the church's obligation to stand up to injustice and to unequivocally oppose ideologies of tyranny. In 1964 the first General Secretary of the World Council of Churches (WCC), Willem Visser 't Hooft, stated that racism, like apartheid, constitutes a *status confessionis* for the churches. The WCC followed this word with action in 1969 in implementing its courageous and far-reaching Program to Combat Racism. In 1977 the Lutheran World Federation (LWF) declared that "apartheid created a *status confessionis* for the church" and in 1984 suspended the white Lutheran Churches in Southern Africa who practiced apartheid. In 1982 the World Alliance of Reformed Churches (WARC) declared apartheid incompatible with Christian belief, and suspended the member churches practicing racial separation. The World Communion of Reformed Churches (WCRC) in 2017 affirmed "that with respect to the situation of injustice and suffering that exists in Palestine, and the cry of the Palestinian Christian community, that the integrity of Christian faith and praxis is at stake" and directed the General Secretary to initiate six direct action steps. Since 2009, Kairos documents from ecumenical organizations from around the world have appeared in response to the Kairos "Moment of Truth" document of the Palestinian Christians, pledging action and providing theological affirmation of this prophetic call by the Palestinian churches.

The present times call for actions as bold, as faithful, and as resolute. The time for decision has arrived. "We call out as Christians and as Palestinians to our Christian brothers and sisters in the churches around the world" reads the 2009 Kairos Palestine document. Eight years later, in 2017, in the Open Letter to the World Council of Churches and the ecumenical movement, the National Coalition of Christian Organizations in Palestine wrote: "Things are beyond urgent. We are on the verge of a catastrophic collapse. This is no time for shallow

diplomacy, Christians!” Now, three years later, this is a cry for hope to our brothers and sisters throughout the world. We invite our fellow Christians, their local congregations, churches and international ecumenical organizations, to receive and respond to our common witness, to join the process of confessing, and to initiate processes to formally reject the oppression of the Palestinian people and any use of the Bible to justify this injustice by committing to the following actions:

- **Initiate processes** at local, denominational and ecumenical levels that recognize the present kairos and the urgent requirement for decisive action regarding the denial of Palestinian rights and the misuse of the Bible. These actions will express the unity of the church in its commitment to stand up to injustice wherever it is to be found.
- **Engage in study** and discernment with respect to theologies and understandings of the Bible that have been used to justify the oppression of the Palestinian people. Offer theologies that prophetically call for an inclusive vision of the land for Israelis and Palestinians, affirming that the creator God is a God of love, mercy and justice; not of discrimination and oppression.
- **Affirm the Palestinians’ right to resist** the occupation, dispossession, and abrogation of their fundamental rights, and join the Palestinians in their creative and nonviolent resistance. The 2005 Palestinian call for Boycott Divestment and Sanctions (BDS) provides a framework for economic, cultural, and academic measures and for direct political advocacy as nonviolent means to end occupation and oppression. The purpose of BDS is not to punish or isolate Israel. It is rather to exert pressure on Israel to comply with international law, and to call upon its government and its people, in the spirit of the Word of God, to enter into the ways of justice and peace, thereby affirming its own rights as well as the rights of the Palestinian people.
- **Demand** also that governments and world bodies employ political, diplomatic and economic means to stop Israel’s violations of human rights and international law.
- **Oppose anti-Semitism** by working for justice against anti-Judaism, racism and xenophobia; oppose the equating of criticism of Israel’s unjust actions with antisemitism.
- **Support initiatives** between Israelis and Palestinians and interfaith partnerships that combat apartheid and occupation and create opportunities to work together for a common future of mutual respect and dignity.
- **Come and see** the reality in the Holy Land with compassionate eyes for the suffering of Palestinians, and stand in solidarity with grassroots initiatives on

the part of all faiths and secular groups who challenge the occupation and who work for a just peace.

We make this call out of concern for the future of both peoples. In the words of Kairos Palestine, our call is rooted in the *logic of love* that seeks to liberate both the oppressor and oppressed in order to create a new society for all the people of the land. We continue to hold firm to the hope articulated in the Kairos document that Palestinians and Israelis have a common future -- that “we can organize our political life, with all its complexity, according to the logic of love and its power, after ending the occupation and establishing justice.” As followers of Jesus, our response to ideologies of exclusivity and apartheid is to uphold a vision of inclusivity and equality for all peoples of the land and to persistently struggle to bring this about.

We acknowledge that by our commitment as Christians to the liberation of the Palestinian people we stand against the theology of Empire, a global order of domination manifesting in racial, economic, cultural, and ecological oppression that threatens humanity and all of creation. In making this confession, we embrace our membership in the community of the broken bread, the church fulfilling its mission to bring the good news of God’s gift of love, mercy, compassion, and abundant life for all.